AFFIRMATIVE POLICY IMPLEMENTATION AND WOMEN EMPOWERMENT IN MALAYSIAN PUBLIC SECTOR

Sharifah Syahirah SS.
Kolej Poly-Tech Mara, Malaysia

Norfarhanis MS.
Universiti Teknologi MARA, Malaysia

ABSTRACT

The women's participation in decision making is important for a country's development and advancement. In Malaysia, there are policies, institution and international commitment introduce to enhance the opportunities for women in public sphere especially as decision makers. Despite these initiatives, women in Malaysia are still facing many challenges due to the work life balance issues and cultural as well as religious interpretation that stereotypes women's roles. Hence, the article attempts to analyze the effectiveness of an affirmative policy namely the 'At Least 30% of Women in Decision Making Positions in Public Sector' policy (2004) in empowering women in Malaysian public sector. By using a cross-sectional and convenience sampling technique this research has selected six ministries, namely Ministry of Health, Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Higher Learning Education, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Rural and Regional Development and Prime Minister Department. The unit of analysis for this paper is women in the middle decision making positions from grade 41-54. Prior to the actual data collection, a pilot study was undertaken for the reliability and validity of the instrument. The findings depict that after the implementation of various initiatives and affirmative policy, women in Malaysia received welfare, opportunities and able to participate in decision making process. However, the findings show the lack of conscientisation level among the respondents. Meanwhile in terms of quality of life, they are facing challenges in occupational stress, work family conflict and health. Yet, they are able to face these challenges through various work life balance strategies.

INTRODUCTION

This article attempts to discuss the current status of women empowerment in Malaysia after the implementation of the 'At Least 30% of Women in Decision Making Positions in Public Sector' policy. The government has implemented many initiatives to empower women especially in education and workforce. The initiatives intensify after the ratification of Convention on elimination of all forms of action against women (CEDAW) in 1995. In order to fulfill CEDAW provisions, the Malaysian government has established Ministry of Women, Family and Community Development in 2001, amendment of Article 8(2) Federal Constitution in 2001 and introduced an affirmative entitled the 'At least 30% of Women in Decision Making Positions in Public Sector' in 2004. In this policy, it has mentioned that the government agrees to implement the at least 30% women decision making position in public sector. The government hopes that the private sector and the non-government sector will implement the same policy (Ministry of Women, Family and Community Development 2011).

Before the implementation of this policy, the percentage of women in decision making in public sector was 11.8% to 12.9% (9th Malaysian Plan 2006: 297). After the introduction of the policy, there are an increasing number of women in decision-making positions in Malaysian public sector. In February 2010, the Public Service Department statistical data depicted a positive trend in this aspect, whereby, the percentage has increased to 28% for women high management position and 61% for women in middle management position. In 2012, there was another increment to 33.7% for high management position. These percentages portray the positive trend due to the introduction and implementation of the policy. Although the percentage of women in decision making position has increased, the percentage of women work force in Malaysia is still remained 46.8% as the lowest rate in Southeast Asia compares to 78.6% in Vietnam, 70.8% in Thailand, 65.1% in Singapore and 53.4% in Indonesia. According to the Minister of Women, Family and Community Development, the government is losing the asset for the country's development. As women have excelled in education with more than 60% female students in high learning institutions, it is important to have a better policy that can enable women to work after having children (Liau 2014).

Therefore, this article attempts to measure the empowerment level of women middle decision making in public sector in order to analyze to what extent the policy have effectively empower them individually.

WOMEN EMPOWERMENT

Women empowerment comes from the root of the idea of power. The notion of power is discussed by gender researchers around the world, such as Malhotra, Schuler, & Boender, (2002), Charlier & Caubergs (2007), Kabeer (1999), Rowlands (1997), Longwe (1991, 1995), Mosedale (2005), Bonisteel (2002) and Luttrell, Quiroz, Scrutton, & Bird (2009) and Syahirah SS. (2010). The notion of power can operate in four different ways: 'Power over', 'Power to', 'Power with', and 'Power within'. 'Power over' describes the relationship between the dominant power and the subordinate power. Here, the dominant power exerts control over the subordinate, requires constant vigilance to maintain power, and invites active and passive resistance. 'Power to' describes the ability to have decision making authority; having power to be involved in problem solving, and being allowed to be creative. 'Power with' refers to the unity of people in a group; this has a common reference to the individual internal power that relates to self-confidence, self -awareness, assertiveness, and the ability to influence and make changes (Rowsland 1995).

The importance of the concept of women's empowerment cannot be denied. Its conceptualizations have been explained, and they provide us with a basic understanding of the concept of women's empowerment. Gender analysis and planning for women's empowerment involves various frameworks. These frameworks provide more details on the measurement of women's empowerment and have become a mechanism to initiate policy or programs for women. This study has adopted the Longwe (1995) framework as an appropriate approach to be used in measuring women empowerment level. This framework is official adopted by United Nations in measuring girls, women, refugees and various minority group empowerment processes (Baines 2001). This framework has five progressive levels of equality arranged in hierarchical order. The first level is welfare, followed by access, conscientisation, participation, and control.

Welfare refers to the basic needs of women, without recognizing or attempting to solve the underlying structural causes which necessitate the provision of welfare services. Women are merely passive beneficiaries of welfare benefits. Access is about equality of access to resources, such equality in education, land, and credit. The path of empowerment is initiated when women recognize that their lack of access to resources is a barrier to their growth and hinders their overall quality of life; next, women take action to redress this. Conscientisation is about how women take appropriate action to reduce gender gaps or gender inequalities. At this level, women should be able to realize the problems that stem from inherent structural and institutional discrimination. Participation is when women are able to participate in discussion as well as decision making without any disturbance such as inequality in participation due to culture and religious interpretations. Mobilization is important for women to reach this level of participation. Women will be empowered to gain increased representation by organizing themselves and by working collectively. The highest level is control, in which women and men are able to share the same power and there is a balance of power that does not involve any form domination. Here, women are able to make decisions regarding their lives, the lives of their children and play an active role in the development process. In this study, these five levels are the indicators to measure the level of women middle decision makers' empowerment in public sector after nearly 10 years of its introduction.

AFFIRMATIVE POLICY: THE 'AT LEAST 30% OF WOMEN IN DECISION MAKING POLICY'

This affirmative policy can be define as a policy introduces by government in order to ensure positive steps taken to increase the representation of women and other minority groups in areas of employment, education, decision making and any areas which have traces of discrimination and exclusion historically (Fullinwinder 2014). In this study, 'At Least 30% Women as Decision Maker in Public Sector' is an affirmative policy to increase the percentage of women in decision making level. This policy is implemented in five different sectors, namely, Legislative 1 (Parliament), Legislative 2 (State Legislative, EXCOs, Local Councils), Executive 1 (Ministries), Executive 2 (Statutory Bodies, Universities), and Judiciary (Civil Court, *Shari'ah* Court, and Native Court). This policy covers a wide sector of Malaysian public administration, and each sector has a different approach. Thus, this study is only focusing on the Executive 1 sector, which is the ministries level. The ministries level has short, medium, and long term action plans for the three interdependent elements (laws, structural, and cultural) (Ministry of Women, Family and Society Development 2014).

In terms of law, the policy covers the Code of Practice against Sexual Harassment. The structural element comprises work-life balance (flexible work arrangement, revised maternity leave, incentive to encourage men to take up a work-life balance arrangement, minimize meeting and work activities); recruitment (balance gender composition, provide training on good gender practices, rectify the imbalance in high decision-making positions); training (coaching and counselling to women officers on the importance of training and further education, counselling sessions for male officers on the importance of supporting their spouses to further study); promotion (develop a more just, transparent, and objective promotion process); and networking and mentoring for women (to encourage more women to hold decision-making positions). The cultural element covers gender sensitisation programmes in the workplace (Ministry of Women, Family and Society Development 2014).

According to Johan Mahmood Merican (2013), "A report, titled Retaining Women in the Workforce, has found that an overwhelming 93% of 824 women respondents who left their jobs have considered re-entering the workforce but 63% found it is difficult to do so. This is largely due to the lack of a framework to assist these women back into the workforce and because many employers feel there is no need for one. About 65% of the women in the survey said it was to raise a family, followed by complaints about lack of work-life balance (43%), while some wanted to care for a family member (38%). Other reasons include expensive childcare (35%), lack of support facilities for women from employer (34%) and inflexible work arrangement (32%) (The Star, March 3, 2013)."

Therefore, this study attempts to examine to what extent this policy empower women in substantively by taking accounts on all the situations and conditions of women in public sector. It is also needs to consider the reproductive roles and Malaysian culture expectations that might discourage women to work and directly hinder them from holding the decision making position. Although the percentage is increasing, to what extent this policy is able to sustain its objective in the long run?

METHODOLOGY

Cross-sectional study is a research design in which the scope of time horizon the data are collected once and takes over a period of days or weeks (Olsen & George 2004, Mann CJ 2003, Levin KA 2006, Sekaran & Bougie 2010). Through this cross-sectional study, the data for this study is collected between January and March 2013. The population of interest in this study are women officers that held middle decision-making positions (grades 41-54) in six ministries, which are Prime Minister's Department, Ministry of Rural and Regional Development, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Higher Learning Education, Ministry of Health, and Ministry of Finance. These ministries have been chosen because of the highest total number of women involved as decision makers.

TABLE 1
Ministries and Population

Ministries	Population
Prime Minister Department	3849
Ministry of Education	124018
Ministry of Higher Learning Education	9391
Ministry of Finance	1801
Ministry of Health	11714
Ministry of Rural and Regional Development	3483
Total population	154,256

(Source: Human Resource Department of Public Service Department, 2012)

Table 1 depicts the population of the six ministries. Since, the total of population is very large for a researcher to conduct a study. Therefore, Krejcie and Morgan (1970) have simplified the sizing decision of a population by providing a table that ensures a good decision model. According to Krejcie and Morgan (1970), when the population falls within the range of 75000-1000000, the sample size should be 384. In this study, the researcher conveniently distributes 384 questionnaires to these six ministries.

In terms of the definition of construct, the five levels of empowerment are defined from theoretical and operational definition. The theoretical definition of welfare highlights the basic needs of women, without recognizing or attempting to solve the underlying structural causes which necessitate the provision of welfare services. Women are merely passive beneficiaries of welfare benefits (Longwe 1995, Syahirah 2010, Bonisteel 2011). Meanwhile, its operational definition refers to the services and facilities provided for women by the

government to reduce their burden and help them balance their time with work and family. Moreover, welfare is concerned with the facilities, women's security (e.g. sexual harassment), and women's reproductive roles. The availability of child care facilities in their workplaces, flexible working hours, meetings and work activities time, maternity leave, and sexual harassment policies are some of the basic service necessities for women, especially the young ones.

In terms of access, theoretical can be defined as equality of access to resources such equality in education, land, and credit. The path of empowerment is initiated when women recognize lack of access to resources as a barrier to their growth and overall quality of life, and take action to redress this (Longwe 1995, Syahirah SS. 2010, Bonisteel 2011). Its operation definition refers to the equality of accessibility to resources; access to technology and information; to receive equal chances to be promoted; access to attend training for career development; clear direction and information regarding work scope; and access to further studies. Based on the definition, the instrumentation of this variable provides confirmation statements on accessibility in the workplace. Accessibility in the workplace has a bigger contribution to the smoothness of working process, which may involve technology and vivid information.

While definition of construct for conscientisation, theoretical is defined as to what extent women are critically aware how to take appropriate action to reduce gender gaps or gender inequalities. Here, they must realize which problems stem from inherent structural and institutional discrimination. They must also recognize the role that women themselves often play in reinforcing the system that restricts their growth (Longwe 1995, Syahirah 2010, Bonisteel 2011). In operational definition, conscientisation refers to women's critical awareness of their roles as a woman decision maker and as a wife. The measurements are divided in two. The first measures their critical awareness; whether they believe that women are eligible to be in decision-making positions and that their talents are important to organizations. The second one looks at their awareness in terms of cultural stereotypes; for example, if their husbands asked them to quit their current jobs, would they obey their husbands? This kind of statement is a confirmation statement to determine whether women in Malaysia are still trapped in the patriarchy system.

In terms of definition of construct for participation theoretically means women make decisions equally alongside men. Mobilization is important for women to reach this level of participation. Women will be empowered to gain increased representation by organizing themselves and by working collectively (Longwe 1995, Syahirah SS. 2010, Bonisteel 2011). Operational definition, this research context, women are mobilizing, working collectively, and equally participating in the decision making process in the workplace. The instrumentation in this variable provides explicit and implicit statements that portray women's mobility and inclusiveness in decision making discussions and work tasks. For example, the questions will ask whether they are excluded during discussions in a meeting, whether they always reached a consensus in a discussion, whether they are able to work collectively to finish the task, and whether top management gives full support and guidance in order to have women participate in that particular situation. To enable women to possess 'power to' in participation, there must be certain circumstances that could bring women to this stage. The openness of top management to encouraging women to participate has also played a crucial role.

Theoretical definition of control describes when women and men share the same power, which means that there is a balance of power that does not involve any domination. Women are able to make decisions regarding their lives and the lives of their children while playing an active role in development process. This element will complete the empowerment process (Longwe 1995, Syahirah SS. 2010, Bonisteel 2011). From operational definition, in the women in decision making context, the control situation comes up when a balance of power between men and women in the workplace exists. Women are free to voice their opinions and exercise their power without a domination and subordination relationship. Not only are women are free to voice their opinions, but their voices are also meant to be heard and are able to influence others. The instrumentation comprises statements on whether women are able to voice their opinions, whether their suggestions or opinions are taken into account for further action, whether they are free to exercise their power under their jurisdiction, whether they are able to manage their workload and working time, and whether there is a subordination and domination relationship between men and women in the workplace. This framework has been explained hierarchically and simultaneously because each variable complements each other, although they are all slightly different in terms of concept and content. To be able to reach the control stage, women must possess the other variables' situations. For example, if women are able to fully exercise the 'participation' situation, then women will be able to reach the 'control' situation.

There are four main sections in the questionnaire. Section A consists of questions on the personal background of the respondents. Section B comprises the elements of women's empowerment framework, and section C consists of questions on the policy. A response format that can be used to measure the control variable is the Likert scale format. This format examines how strongly respondents agree or disagree with the questions on a five point scale, on which 5= strongly agree, 4= agree, 3= not sure, 2= disagree, and 1= strongly disagree.

RESULTS

The measurement of central tendency is part of the centre of distribution in frequency distributions. It consists of the mean for the average scores out of the total score. The purpose of using the measurement of central tendency is to determine the level of women empowerment. Based on the mean value, the agreeableness of respondents towards the statements in the questionnaire can be determined. The mean value for women empowerment ranges from 4.144 to 4.221. The respondents are likely to agree with all statements in the questionnaire regarding women's empowerment. In terms of welfare, M= 4.221, SD= .439. Here, 56.3% agreed and 39.7% strongly agreed that in their workplace, there are childcare facilities provided. 51.3% of respondents agreed and 42.4% strongly agreed that they can choose a flexible working hour scheme. Meanwhile, 60.6% of respondents agreed and 24.2% strongly agreed that meetings and work activities are only held during working hours. In terms of maternity leave, 59.6% agreed and 32.8% strongly agreed that they are satisfied with the three months of maternity leave. Lastly, 59.6% and 32.8%, or the majority of the respondents agreed and strongly agreed that sexual harassment rarely happens in their workplace.

In terms of access, the mean score is M= 4.144, SD= .411, in which the 4.144 represents 'agree' in the scale. Question number 1 indicates that 62.9% of respondents agreed and 32.8% strongly agreed that they are able to use technology facilities for the purpose of work. Question number 2 indicates that 64.2% agreed and 22.5% strongly agreed that they always have a chance to pursue studying a higher level of education. In terms of training, question number 3 indicates that 63.9% agreed and 23.2 % strongly agreed that they have the opportunity to receive training for their career development. Question number 4 indicates that 62.3% agreed and 27.2% strongly agreed that they have always received clear instruction and information regarding their work. Lastly, in terms of promotion, 61.9% agreed and 26.2% strongly agreed that there is an equal chance for them to be promoted.

For the third main indicator of women's empowerment, conscientisation, the mean score is M= 4.162, SD= .401 in which the 4.162 represents 'agree' in the scale. Question number 1 indicates that 49.3% of the respondents agreed and 45.7% strongly agreed that they believe that women are able to be in the same decision making positions as men. Question number 2 indicates 46% of respondents agreed and 50% strongly agreed that men and women should have work-life balance together. Question number 3 indicates that 48% and 50.3% of the respondents agreed and strongly agreed that men also should take part in managing family life and not only focus on their careers. Question number 4 indicates that 51.3% and 44.4% of the respondents agreed and strongly agreed that women also possess rational thinking in decision making, as men do. Question number 5 shows that 45.7% of the respondents agreed and 49.5% strongly agreed that they believe women have the capabilities to compete competitively with men in careers. Question number 6 shows that 44% and 36% of respondents agreed and strongly agreed being a fulltime housewife is no longer the best occupation for women.

Question number 7 indicates that 45% and 18.2% of respondents agreed and strongly agreed that men are cleverer than women in making decisions, but 12.9% are not sure of the statement. 19.9% of respondents disagreed and 12.9% strongly disagreed with the statement that men are cleverer than women in making decisions. Question number 8 shows that 44% and 20% of respondents agreed and strongly agreed that they would have to quit their jobs if their husbands asked them to do so. 17.5% of respondents are not sure and 15.6% disagreed with the statement. Question number 9 shows that 60.3% and 27.8% of respondents agreed and strongly agreed that as a wife, they must ask a husband's permission if they want to go out from home. Lastly, 49% and 34.8% of the respondents agreed and strongly agreed that they would quit their jobs and focus on family if they had the financial stability to do so.

The mean score for participation is M= 4.150, SD= .405, in which the 4.150 represents 'agree' according to the scale. The first question on participation indicates that 62.9% and 24.8% of the respondents agreed and strongly agreed that they never felt neglected in discussion. The second question indicates that 66.6% and 26.8% of the respondents always reach a consensus with colleagues and top management in making decisions. The third question indicates that 68.5% and 25.5% of the respondents are able to work collectively with colleagues and top management; the fourth question indicates that 70.5% and 18.9% of the respondents agreed and strongly agreed that there is a channel for them to discuss improving the work process with top management. Lastly, the fifth question indicates that 63.2% and 24.2% of the respondents agreed and strongly agreed that they always received some useful guidance for their career development from their top management.

Lastly, mean for control value indicates M= 4.215, SD= .363, in which 4.215 represents 'agree' in the scale. This shows that the majority of the respondents agree with the five statements regarding control in the questionnaire. The first question indicates that 68.5% and 28.8% of the respondents agreed and strongly agreed that they are free to voice their opinion during the discussion in meetings. The second question indicates that 70.5% and 27.2% of the respondents agreed and strongly agreed that women's opinions are always taken into account by other officers. The third question indicates that 66.2% and 27.5% of the respondents agreed and strongly agreed that they

are free to exercise their duties without any restriction. The fourth question indicates that 69.5% and 24.5% of the respondents agreed and strongly agreed that they are able to manage their workload. Last question indicates that 72.8% of the respondents agreed and 20.5% strongly agreed that in their workplace, there is no domination or subordination relationship between men and women.

DISCUSSION

The discussion on the women's empowerment level comprises five levels which are welfare, access, conscientisation, participation and control. In terms of welfare, the majority of the respondents agreed that there is a childcare facilities provided in their workplace. They also can choose the flexible working hour scheme and agreed that meeting and work activities are only being held during working hour. In terms of maternity leave, they are satisfied with the three months of maternity leave and lastly, majority of the respondents feels that the sexual harassment rarely to be happening in their workplace. Based on the findings, it proves that the government has implemented the efforts in order to improve women welfare.

In terms of access, majority of the respondents agreed that they are able to use technology facilities for the purpose of work in everywhere and they always have a chance to pursue their study in the higher level of education, In terms of training, the respondents agreed that and they have the opportunity to receive training for their career development. Other than that, more than 80% of respondents agreed that they always received a clear instruction and information regarding their work. Lastly is in terms of promotion, majority agreed that there is an equal chance for them to be promoted. The finding shows that the government provides equal accessibility for women in a workplace. This is parallel with Salehuddin (2007) study which states, the government has provided government officers an opportunity to further their education at the high level and the accessibility to receive training to improve their skills.

On conscientisation part, the mean scores show that women decision makers realize their roles as decision makers. They believe that women have the capabilities to be in decision-making positions. However, although the respondents agreed their roles as decision makers, somehow they are still trapped in the patriarchy culture. Women have been culturally socialized to adopt that kind of belief and that is the reason why women not able to participate in decision-making position are because they still trapped in the patriarchy culture. This finding is parallel with the studies made by Cecilia Ng (1997, 2010) and Sanda & Sackey (2011). In terms of participation, the findings prove that the respondents take decisions equally alongside men. They are working collectively with each other to complete certain tasks and they can participate for the improvement of work procedure in their workplace. Probably this is due to the number of women's representation as decision makers in the middle level are higher than men (Public Service Department 2010).

The last discussion is control. Majority of the respondents feels free to voice up their opinion during the discussion in the meeting. They also agreed that women's opinion have always been taken into account from other officers. It shows that women are able to generate a good idea that can benefit the organization. Here, it portrays that the organization is not underestimating women's ability as decision makers. Other than that, they are free to exercise their duty without any restriction and able to manage their workload. It depends on women how they should exercise their duty and manage their workload since they have a freedom to exercise their duty. Probably, working long hours is one of their options to manage the workload. That is the reason why the respondents having occupational stress. Lastly, they feel that there is no domination and subordination relationship between men and women. However, based on findings, there is no guarantee that there is a balance of power between men and women without domination.

Although the descriptive percentage women outnumbered men in a workplace, it is too early to conclude that women have achieved the substantive equality in a workplace. There is no detail information on how the public sector achieves the 30% quota. The achievement has been announced by the Ministry of Women, Family and Community development without report and it found to be vague (CEDAW Shadow Report, 2012).

CONCLUSION

This study indicates that women empowerment process is visible in Malaysian public sector especially after the introduction of the affirmative policy. After the in-depth discussions of findings, this study would like to suggest several recommendations to ministry, policy maker and Malaysian government as a whole. Firstly, is to develop the new model of career development, in which the model of career development should be more concern with women and develop the working environment that suits well with women. This recommendation has been proposed by Sweetman (1997) and Cecilia Ng (2012). Although the content of the 30% policy has addressed the efforts on this

matter, the government is not implementing what exactly stated in the policy. The example is on flexible working hour. The policy introduced flexitime, teleworking, e-working, part time work, team time work and reduced work hour. Until now, the flexible working hours that the public sector has is only staggered working hours. Therefore, the action should be strengthened so that the women career model can be created. However, to develop women's career model in the working environment, it has to start with believing and the attitude of people at work (Sweetman 1997). Here, people who work in the organization have to work together to facilitate changes. The changes should start from the superior level, which is the higher level management in the government. They are responsible to change the patriarchy culture in a workplace so that the lower management would follow the changes. Agreed with Sweetman (1997), Cecilia Ng (2012) study stated that each of the organizations has their own sub-culture; this sub-culture could actually be an obstacle for the organization to change although a good policy has been introduced. Therefore, when higher level management applies changes by eliminates patriarchy culture, the sub culture also would change. Although it is difficult to change culture, at least when top management starts to eliminates patriarchy situation, the others will slowly follow.

The second recommendation is related to the conscientisation dimension in women's empowerment level. The issue of conscientisation is closely related to the management cultural issues. Based on the findings, women lagged behind in terms of their conscientisation to participate in decision-making positions. It shows that public sector organizations still have strong male model management oriented. Hence, it is not easy for new policy advocates to lobby changes, as innovative policies do not automatically translate into institutional practice (Staudt, 1998). These basically involve complex political processes. Parallel with Sweetman (1997) and Cecilia Ng (2012), for the second recommendation Sanda & Sackey (2011), Leaprott & McDonald (2011) and Rahamah (2012) has suggested that, to counter this problem, the awareness to close the gender gap part should not come from women alone. The most important thing is the government and ministry should make an effort to counter this issue. The changes need to happen and those changes must take into consideration of few factors such as educational system, socialization process, government policy and political conscious. Furthermore, since the most influence dimensions that affect subjective wellbeing are access and participation, there are some actions that the government could apply. Some of the steps that could be taken by the government are to improve the working system, by removing the bureaucracy in the working process. Besides that, increase the using of technology information system in work processes, and organized more working team so that they can work effectively and collectively to finish the task. On conscientisation aspect, ministries should implement the program to educate women on how important for them to work for the country's development. Based on the findings, it shows that the 30% policy is not strong enough to change the culture of the organization and women's consciousness to work for the development of a country. The 30% policy should strongly advocate the conscientisation aspect of developing the working culture that does not only focus on the male dominated model but also a model that upholds substantive equality between men and women.

To develop a model that upholds substantive equality between men and women, it must involve the commitment from all the ministries, and MWFCD as an advocator and facilitator in the process. Therefore, the third recommendation is about to strengthen the action on the 30% policy. The CEDAW NGO Shadow Report 2012 has listed several recommendations under article 3, 4, and 7. According to CEDAW report, gender should be mainstreamed into all sectors and policies in the five year development plan of the government and on the basis of equality between women and men. The Gender Focal Points of each of the ministries should have their roles and functions clearly defined with proper guidelines on strategies and actions to be taken to ensure that gender mainstreaming is effectively implemented within each government ministry. To ensure the substantive equality is properly being implemented, the government should develop a concrete timeline for the achievement of at least a 30% policy and specify exactly which 'decision-making' positions are included. Although the content of the policy includes the details about the action plan in the document, the process of the implementation of 30% policy is vague and closed to public. The 30% policy should provide the exact information on each activity in the action plan. Therefore, it is important for the government to specify an action plan that could improve the working process, particularly at the access and the participation level.

REFERENCES

Abdullah, N., Ismail, R., Mohd Noor, Z., & Ahmad, F. 2012, 'Kebarangkalian bekerja wanita,berkahwin di Malaysia'. *Jurnal Ekonomi Malaysia*, vol. 46 no. 1. Available from: http://ejournal.ukm.my [26 September 2014].

Ahmad, Aminah, & Zoharah, O. 2008, 'Gender difference in work-family conflict and family friendly employment policy practice'. *The International Journal of the Humanities*, vol. 6 no. 3, pp. 15-26.

Ahmad, Aminah 1995, 'Role conflict and coping behaviour of Married Working Women', *Pertanika Journal of Social Science & Humanities*. Vol. 3, no. 4, pp. 97-104.

Ahmad, Aminah 2007, 'Family-friendly employment policy practices in the Malaysian government and selected private organizations', *Journal of Global Business Management*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 128-135.

Baines, Erin K 2001, *A practical guide to empowerment*, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, Geneva.

Convention Elimination Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) 2012, *Malaysian Non-Government Organizations,* Available from: http://wao.org.my/ [10 December, 2012].

Economic Planning Unit Malaysia 2011, *The 9th Malaysian Plan*, Available from: http://www.epu.gov.my/en/ninth-malaysia-plan-2006-2010 [12 March 2015].

Field, A. P 2009, *Discovering statistics using SPSS: (and sex and drugs and rock 'n' roll)*, SAGE Publication, Los Angeles.

Fullinwider, Robert 2014, 'Affirmative action', *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Available from: http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2014/entries/affirmative=action/ [12 March 2015].

Kabeer, N. 1999, 'Resources, agency, achievement: Reflections on the Measurement of Women's Empowerment. *Development and Change*, vol.30, pp. 435-464.

Kumaraswamy, N. & Azizah 2007, 'Subjective Well-Being of Women', *Malaysian Journal of Psychiatry*, vol. 16 no. 2, pp. 27-35.

Liau, Y-Sing 2014, 'Mothers wanted back in workforce as Malaysia seeks growth', Available from: www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2014-08-19/malaysia-seeks-to-draw-women-back-to-work-southeast-asia [12March 2015].

Luttrell, C, Quiroz, S, Scrutton, C & Bird, K 2009, 'Understanding and operationalizing empowerment'. *Overseas Development Institute*, vol. 308. Available from http://www.odi.org.uk/ [2 December 2012].

Longwe, S. H 2002, 'Addressing rural gender issues: a framework for leadership and mobilization'. *Paper presented at the III World Congress for Rural Women, Madrid*, Available from: http://www.sarpn.org/ [3 December 2012].

Ministry of Women, Family and Community Development Malaysia (MWFCD) 2011, 'Dasar 30% wanita peringkat pembuat peputusan', Available from: www.kpwkm.gov.my/ [12 March, 2015].

Ministry of Women, Family and Community Development Malaysia (MWFCD) 2007, 'Measuring and monitoring gender equality in Malaysia', Available from: http://www.undp.org.my/ [19 October, 2011].

Mosedale, S 2005, 'Assessing women's empowerment: towards a conceptual framework'. *Journal of International Development*, vol.17, pp. 243-257.

Naziatul, A.M.R., Rahmah, I., Poo, B.T 2012, 'Kadar pulangan pendidikan mengikut jantina di Malaysia', *Prosiding PERKEM* vol.1,pp. 446-456, Available from:www.ukm.my/fep/perkem/ [2 December2012].

Ng, Cecilia 2010, 'The hazy new dawn: democracy, women in politics in Malaysia', *Asia Research Institute*,vol.1 no.36. Available from: http://www.ari.nus.edu.sg/. [2 December, 2012]

Ng, Cecilia, 2012, 'Gender and governance: the politics of federalism in Malaysia', *Kajian Malaysia,Journal of Malaysian Studies*, vol.30, no.2, pp. 1–26.

Noraini, N. M 2006, Malaysian Women's State of Well-Being: Empirical Validation of a Conceptual Model. *The Journal of Social Psychology,* vol.146, no.1,pp. 95-115.

Rahamah, N 2012, 'Wanita bekerja dan pengurusan keluarga',*Malaysia Journal of Society and Space*, vol.8, no.7, pp. 155-162, Available from: http://www.ukm.my/geografia. [2 February 2013]

Rowlands, J. 1997, *Questioning empowerment: working with women in Honduras*. Oxfam, GB, UK and Ireland.

Sackey, J. & Sanda, M 2011, 'Sustenance of human capital: social support as a managerial stress reliever for women in developing economies', *Research and Practice in Human Resource Management*, vol. 19, no.2, pp. 1-23.

Sekaran, U., & Bougie, R 2010, *Research Methods for Business* (Fifth Edition ed.): Wiley.

Syahirah SS, Sharifah 2010, Pemerkasaan representasi politik wanita di Malaysia: analisis pilihan raya umum ke -12 (PRU12) 2008, *The Journal of Administrative Science*, vol. 7, no.1,pp. 11-37.

Sweetman, C 1997, Gender, education and training. *Oxfam Focus on Gender Series*, Available from:http://policy-practice.oxfamhosted.co.uk/. [2 December 2012].